Are Business Schools Helping to Reduce Gender Inequality in the Workplace – or Not?

Patricia M. Flynn, PhD
Trustee Professor of Economics & Management
Former Dean, McCallum Graduate School of Business
Bentley University, USA
pflynn@bentley.edu

“The Role of Business and Business Schools in Addressing Gender Equality and Women’s Empowerment”
Economic & Social Research Council (ESRC) Research Seminar
Hull University Business School
21 March 2017
Topics

- Gender Inequality in Business Schools

- Patterns and Trends by Gender
  - Graduates
  - Faculty
  - Academic Department Chairs
  - Deans

- Recommendations for Change
Gender Inequality in Business Schools

- Business schools can and should help mitigate the underrepresentation of women in management and leadership positions in the corporate world.

- However, instead of being part of the solution, business schools are often part of the problem, as major gender gaps continue to exist within these organizations.*

- Women continue to be significantly under-represented in business schools as deans, associate deans, full-time faculty, tenured faculty, and academic department chairs, as well as in textbooks, case studies and as speakers.

* See Flynn, Cavanagh and Bilimoria, 2015a & b. (References listed at end.)
Patterns and Trends, by Gender

GRADUATES
Graduation Trends

- Women’s share of all bachelor’s degrees awarded in the US is 57.0%, while women comprise only 42.6% of those awarded in US business schools. (2013/14).

- The number of females graduating from a US business school with a bachelor’s degree peaked in 2011/12. Females earning an MBA in the US peaked in 2010/11.

- At non-US business schools, females comprise greater percentages of graduates at the bachelor’s, MBA and specialized masters levels than in the US. The female % of doctoral graduates from b-schools outside the US is comparable to the US.
### Female B-School Graduates*, by Level, 2015/16, and 5-Year Trends, US

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Female Graduates, 2015/16</th>
<th>5-Year Trend</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s</td>
<td>42.5%</td>
<td>-4.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBA</td>
<td>36.1%</td>
<td>-25.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialized</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Masters</td>
<td>47.6%</td>
<td>+29.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctorates</td>
<td>40.5%</td>
<td>+19.3%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

- AACSB member schools

Source: Unless noted otherwise, all data are from AACSB.
Female B-School Graduates*, by Level, Non-US and Relative to US, 2015/16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Level</th>
<th>Female Graduates</th>
<th>Non-US/US ratio of Female Graduates</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>%</td>
<td>#</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bachelor’s</td>
<td>50.3%</td>
<td>54,745</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>MBA</td>
<td>40.6%</td>
<td>13,560</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Specialized Masters</td>
<td>52.9%</td>
<td>19,564</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Doctorates</td>
<td>39.8%</td>
<td>810</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Note: AACSB member schools. We lack trend data for non-US schools. The AACSB data show significant growth in female graduates at all levels, however, these data are not comparable with the US figures as a significant proportion of the non-US numbers are attributable to a large increase in the # of business schools outside the US becoming AACSB members during that period.
Looking Ahead: GMAT Takers

- In 2014, women were 43.3% of GMAT test takers.
- In the U.S. 38% (n=88,161) of GMAT test takers were women.
- In the following five countries, women were the majority of GMAT takers:
  - China, 65% (57,783)
  - Taiwan, 57% (3,404)
  - Russia, 53% (1,952)
  - Thailand, 58% (1,816)
  - Vietnam, 59% (1,455)

Source: Graduate Management Admission Council (GMAC)
Looking Ahead: The Impacts of President Trump’s Policies

- Students at post-secondary institutions with temporary visas in the US from the 7 countries in Trump’s executive order, 2015/16: 17,324
  - Iran 12,269
  - Iraq 1,901
  - Libya 1,514
  - Syria 783
  - Yemen 599
  - Sudan 253
  - Somalia 35
  
  Source: Institute of International Education.

- The impacts are expected to go well beyond these numbers and these countries.
- 31 colleges/universities have signed onto the court brief against the Trump travel ban. (7 in MA: BU, Brandeis, Harvard, MIT, NU, Tufts, WPI)
→ Faculty
## B-School Faculty by Tenure Status, % Female, US, 2005/06, 2015/16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Tenure Status</th>
<th>% Female</th>
<th>2005/06</th>
<th>2015/16</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Tenured</td>
<td></td>
<td>19.9%</td>
<td>26.6%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tenure Track</td>
<td></td>
<td>32.9%</td>
<td>37.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Non-Tenure Track</td>
<td></td>
<td>37.1%</td>
<td>38.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Position</td>
<td>2006/07</td>
<td>2015/16</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>--------------------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Instructors</td>
<td>41.9%</td>
<td>40.1%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Professors</td>
<td>35.5%</td>
<td>37.9%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Professors</td>
<td>26.5%</td>
<td>32.6%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Full Professors</td>
<td>14.9%</td>
<td>20.4%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>All full-time Faculty</td>
<td>27.1%</td>
<td>31.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Female Full-time Faculty, by Field, by Rank, US, 2015/16

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Asst. Prof.</th>
<th>Assoc. Prof.</th>
<th>Full Prof.</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>43.4%</td>
<td>39.0%</td>
<td>24.8%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIS/MIS</td>
<td>26.4%</td>
<td>27.7%</td>
<td>18.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>31.9%</td>
<td>24.5%</td>
<td>14.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>27.5%</td>
<td>26.1%</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR Management</td>
<td>56.6%</td>
<td>54.7%</td>
<td>29.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>38.4%</td>
<td>40.4%</td>
<td>28.3%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>47.5%</td>
<td>35.3%</td>
<td>26.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quant Methods/Stat</td>
<td>31.7%</td>
<td>22.4%</td>
<td>13.9%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Academic Department Chairs, % Female, US, 2000/01, 2016/17; Non-US, 2016/17

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Accounting</td>
<td>23.5%</td>
<td>24.9%</td>
<td>29.5%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CIS/MIS</td>
<td>18.1%</td>
<td>23.6%</td>
<td>5.9%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Economics</td>
<td>11.7%</td>
<td>17.3%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Finance</td>
<td>7.9%</td>
<td>12.8%</td>
<td>12.1%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>HR Management</td>
<td>13.6%</td>
<td>30.0%</td>
<td>50.0%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Management</td>
<td>22.6%</td>
<td>33.9%</td>
<td>16.7%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Marketing</td>
<td>17.1%</td>
<td>24.6%</td>
<td>31.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Quant Methods/Stat</td>
<td>11.1%</td>
<td>9.7%</td>
<td>0.0%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
DEANS
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Position</th>
<th>2009/10</th>
<th>2016/17</th>
<th>2016/2017</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dean</td>
<td>16.3%</td>
<td>23.0%</td>
<td>21.4%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Associate Dean</td>
<td>28.5%</td>
<td>34.1%</td>
<td>28.2%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Assistant Dean</td>
<td>55.3%</td>
<td>61.1%</td>
<td>35.7%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
• **RECOMMENDATIONS FOR CHANGE**
[1] Acknowledge the
... let’s talk about these issues.
Integrate Gender Issues into B-School Curriculum, Research & Environment

- Numerous studies document a lack of female role models in management and leadership cases studies, as well as in textbooks, and in business programs as speakers, etc. (See Flynn, Cavanagh & Bilimoria, 2015b)

  Work to change this.

  - A free resource: The UN PRME Global Repository on Gender Issues
UN PRME Working Group on Gender Equality (WGGE)

- PRME (Principles for Responsible Management Education) involves 600+ business schools in 80+ countries.

- The WGGE was launched in 2011, in response to the UN’s Women’s Empowerment Principles (WEPs)

- Mission: To bring together academics and employers to provide support and resources for integrating gender issues and awareness into management education curricula and research.

- Co-Chairs: Kathryn Haynes (UK), Maureen Kilgour (Canada), and Patricia Flynn (US)
WGGE’s Global Repository

- Includes case studies, syllabi, research, publications, other course materials.

- Created by over 25 faculty in 7 countries.

- [http://prmegenderequalityworkinggroup.unprme.wikispaces.net/Welcome+to+the+Wikispace](http://prmegenderequalityworkinggroup.unprme.wikispaces.net/Welcome+to+the+Wikispace)

- Includes 15 disciplines
Global Repository Disciplines

- Accounting
- Corporate Governance
- CSR
- Economics
- Entrepreneurship
- Finance
- History & Anthropology
- IT
- Law
- Leadership
- Management
- Marketing
- Negotiation
- Non-Profit Management
- Operations
PRME WGGE Series on Gender

PRME/Greenleaf Publishing Series on Gender:


- *Overcoming Challenges to Gender Equality in the Workplace: Innovation and Leadership* (2016)

Editors: Kathryn Haynes (UK), Maureen Kilgour (Canada) and Patricia Flynn (US)
Expand Discussions of Managerial and Executive Career Paths with Undergraduate and Graduate Women Students

Women in S&P 500 Companies

- CEOs: 4.0%
- Corporate Directors: 19.2%
- Senior Executives: 25.1%
- First and Mid-level Managers: 36.8%
- S&P 500 Workers: 45.0%

(Catalyst, Feb.3, 2016)
Educational Backgrounds and Career Paths to Top Management Positions

- Educational backgrounds of the Fortune 100 CEOs (2013):
  - Undergraduate: Engineering (14%), Business Administration (11%), Accounting (9%), Economics (8%)
  - Graduate: The majority (65) of these CEOs have a graduate degree, which is most often (57%) an MBA. [20% JD; 6% Economics]
  Source: N2growth, 2013

- Career paths to top management
  - Women tend to remain in specific STAFF functions, such as HR, Public Relations, Communications, Finance and Administration, working in relatively narrow silos. (“Glass walls”)
  - In contrast, many of their male counterparts shift over time into LINE responsibilities, in Operations, Sales, Research and Product Management and General Management – positions that provide the kinds of diverse and board experiences deemed necessary to be selected for top management.

While the problems of gender equality in business schools have many aspects, some of gender gaps can be traced to pipeline issues.

- Fields, such as CIS and Economics, for instance, generate relatively few female doctorates.
## Doctorate Degrees Conferred, % Female, by Select Field, U.S., 2013/14

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Field</th>
<th>Non-Business</th>
<th>Business</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Veterinary Medicine</td>
<td>79.0%</td>
<td>OB Studies</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Psychology</td>
<td>74.7%</td>
<td>Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Administration &amp; Soc. Service Professions</td>
<td>67.0%</td>
<td>Business, Mgmt &amp; Marketing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Physical Therapy</td>
<td>66.5%</td>
<td>Accounting</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Health Professions</td>
<td>58.4%</td>
<td>Finance</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Pharmacy</td>
<td>61.0%</td>
<td>Economics</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Law</td>
<td>46.8%</td>
<td>CIS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Engineering</td>
<td>22.7%</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Source: U.S. National Center for Education Statistics
Pipeline Recommendations

- Conduct research on where female students (undergraduate and graduate) are going and why.

- Provide information to female undergraduate and master’s degree students on the opportunities for, and potential benefits of, pursuing traditionally male-dominated fields, and doctorate degrees (and possibly becoming business school faculty.)

Examples of two new programs ➔
Terry Women’s Initiative (2015)
Terry College of Business, Univ. of Georgia, US

- Program featured by AACSB in its “Innovations that Inspire” initiative.
  - Designed to educate and empower women, especially those in traditionally-male dominated career paths.
  - Focuses on both hard and soft skills.
  - Activities to date include: a mentorship program for undergraduates, corporate site visits, panels about traditionally male career paths and opportunities, a golf clinic, and a summer book club.
  - Future events include: student conference on positioning for success after college, and a retreat for juniors and seniors on best ways to leverage their potential.

For details see: www.terry.uga.edu/students/womens-initiative
Pipeline Recommendations (cont.)

- Most business school deans were an associate dean or a department chair before becoming dean. Many of these stepping stone positions are filled by full professors. Yet, as shown earlier, females are still only 20% of b-school full professors, and considerably < that in key areas.

- Recommendations for female Assistant Professors:
  - Provide advice on how to best spend pre-tenure time.
  - Provide a mentor (who needn’t be female).
  - Encourage joint authorship possibilities.
Encourage and Appoint More Women Academic Leaders in Business Schools

- Encourage more female full professors to apply for associate dean and department chair positions.
- Appoint more women as “Interim dean,” a position which often leads them to the “permanent” dean’s position.
- Have gender diversity on all faculty and dean search committees. Insist executive search firms provide a gender diverse roster of candidates.
- Actively work with and engage male (as well as female) faculty and administrative colleagues in fostering gender equality in the business school. (See Catalyst, 2009)

Source: McTiernan and Flynn, 2011
Encourage On-going Informal Professional Development for Women Faculty and Administrators

- Example: Women Administrators in Management Education (WAME)
  - Affinity group of AACSB-International
  - Workshops and seminars
  - Can be a catalyst for change
  - Can provide mentors and role models
Do’s and Don’ts for Prospective and New Women Deans*

DO:
- Get a mentor or two (male and/or female).
- Delegate (with deadlines and keep in touch.)
- Always do your homework (and challenge, tactfully, those who don’t). Speak up. Be heard.
- Effectively network and seek out opportunities consistent with your goals.
- Use your time wisely. Learn to say “NO” more often.
  - Don’t do things just because your calendar is open.
  - Be selective. Recommend someone else for various activities/events.
- Maintain a sense of humor.
- Continue to develop key skills such as negotiation, fundraising, etc.

* From various WAME discussions.
Don’ts

- DO NOT take things at work personally

- DO NOT be invisible
  - Get on the program at annual deans meetings, etc.
  - Volunteer to be a speaker or moderator at business and professional association events, e.g., Chamber of Commerce, Business Roundtable.

- DO NOT teach courses while dean. Occasional guest lectures are fine. (Having regularly scheduled office hours is a good thing.)

- DO NOT apologize or put yourself down when asking questions.

- DO NOT wait until your children are grown up to become dean.
Foster an Inclusive Educational Environment in which All Male and Female Students, Faculty and Administrators can Thrive

- Beyond increasing student exposure to female role models in textbooks, case studies, etc., make sure students (male and female) meet and interact with female managers and leaders.
- Hold department chairs and deans accountable in their annual evaluations for gender equality and diversity more generally.
- Provide training to faculty and administrators on unconscious (and conscious) bias.
- Incorporate more flexibility into the faculty career path, via for instance, allowing extensions in time for applying for tenure for parents, be they female or male.
- Take advantage of the valuable resources available across the globe on ways to improve gender equality in higher education. (See Flynn, Cavanagh and Bilimoria, 2015)
Conduct More Research on Gender Issues Related to Business Schools and Career Paths, e.g.:

- Patterns and trends of b-school graduates outside the US, and comparisons with the US.

- Promotion and tenure patterns of b-school faculty by gender within and outside the US.

- Managerial and executive career paths of graduates with Specialized Masters Degrees, within and outside the US.

- The $400,000 gender pay gap female MBAs face (Bellstrom, 2016).

- Lessons learned from countries that have similar percentages of female managers and CEOs (i.e., Finland, Ireland, the Netherlands, Switzerland). (ILO 2015)
QUESTIONS? COMMENTS? ADVICE?
References


References (cont.)


